

APPENDIX B.

ELIMINATED STRATEGIES

GROWTH IN DEFINED AREAS

All strategies in this category were progressed to the second stage of evaluation.

OPEN SPACE PRESERVATION

1. Modify zoning to provide an optional cluster bylaw provision.

Location:

- Amenia

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: This provision maintains the underlying zoning ratio of housing units per acre but groups the housing units on undersized lots to preserve open space or farmland. A major advantage of clustering is that it can be used to set back and screen development from the roads, thereby providing the appearance of open space as development proceeds.

A cluster bylaw provision protects a growth area from sprawl development resulting from standard subdivisions or strip commercial development. It also supports the maintenance of rural character outside the growth areas. This is already a provision in the zoning code for Dover and North East and is encouraged by the Pawling Planning Board. The primary concern expressed regarding this alternative is that clustering is considered optional and, although the Town might encourage it, there

is no assurance that clustering will occur and that open space will be maintained.

Reason for Elimination: An optional provision does not provide for consistency among developers or over time as the planning board members change.

2. Institute right-to-farm legislation.

Locations:

- Amenia
- North East

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Right-to-farm laws are local legislation that limits anti-farm lawsuits. Adjacent neighbors who wish to restrict normal farm practices such as the use of pesticides or fertilizers typically initiate anti-farm lawsuits. As the character of the northern study area changes from a rural/agricultural landscape to a mixture of agricultural and residential, conflicts may occur between neighbors without specific right-to-farm legislation.

Reason for Elimination: Did not receive significant support in the public arena.

3. **Farmland tax relief.**

Locations:

- Amenia
- North East

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: At a minimum, this would include assessment of farm buildings at their depreciation value rather than their replacement value, currently a legal option for towns. Consideration should also be given to the home site assessment process. The home site assessment should not include a 5-acre residential zone if only 1 acre is used for the house and associated grounds, with the remaining acreage used for active farming. More aggressive programs, such as those developed in New England,¹ would require state enabling legislation.

If this strategy were used, towns would experience a loss in tax revenue. Unless state or county funds were used to reimburse towns, they would have to compensate through increased property taxes. Currently, no state enabling legislation exists that would allow local communities to reassess their agricultural lands or give tax abatements to relieve pressure on farmers.² Such legislation would be a positive step towards farmland preservation.

Reason for Elimination: Received inadequate support or negative feedback in the public arena.

¹ Schnidman, Frank, Michael Smiley, and Eric G. Woodbury. *Retention of Land for Agriculture: Policy, Practice and Potential in New England*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: Lincoln Institute of Land Policy, 1990.

² *Town of North East Comprehensive Plan*.

4. Fee-simple acquisition is an exclusive interest in the land.

Locations:

- Pawling
- Dover
- Amenia
- North East

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: This is the most widely used land conservation technique. Dutchess County's Open Space and Farmland Protection Matching Grant program provides up to 50 percent matching grants for open space and farmland protection.

Although this approach results in permanent protection of the land and ensures public control and access, there are several disadvantages. Of primary concern is the expense. Even with matching grants and "bargain sales," communities would only be able to acquire limited areas. Subsequent to acquisition, the responsibility of maintenance and management is also expensive and time-consuming.

Reason for Elimination: Expense and negative feedback in the public arena.

5. Purchase of development rights.

Locations:

- Pawling
- Dover
- Amenia

- North East

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: This technique involves acquisition of development rights or conservation restrictions. This approach generally costs less than fee-simple acquisition. In some cases, wealthy private owners may be willing to donate these interests, particularly where public access is not involved but tax advantages are. Under this approach, management may also remain with the owner, limiting the costs and management requirements of the town. The disadvantages of this approach include potential future misunderstandings between the owner of the easement and second- or third-generation landowners. Another drawback is lack of a provision for public access.

Reason for Elimination: Negative feedback and concern for devaluation of farmland.

6. Change some of the existing residential large-lot zoning to agricultural zoning.

Locations:

- Amenia
- North East

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Typically, large-lot zoning discourages non-farm uses in agricultural areas. However, the typical minimum lot size of 3 to 5 acres, which is inadequate to discourage suburban sprawl and is therefore ineffective in preserving farmland.

Reason for Elimination: Did not receive significant support in the public arena.

TRANSPORTATION SYSTEMS MANAGEMENT

7. Short-term Capacity Improvements.

Locations:

- Wheeler Road/HVPC, Dover
- CR 21 (Pleasant Ridge Road), Dover

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: These intersections were initially identified as having potential capacity concerns in the future as traffic volumes within the Route 22 corridor increase. Adjustments to signal timing and/or phasing could address these capacity concerns and improve traffic flow.

Reason for Elimination: The CPTF eliminated these intersections from further consideration due to greater concern for capacity issues at other locations. Routine maintenance and adjustment of these signals by NYSDOT maintenance forces may adequately address future capacity concerns.

8. Safety Improvements: Intersections with Route 22.

Locations:

- Corbin Road (Old Route 22), Pawling
- River Road, Pawling
- Hurds Corners Road, Pawling
- Cart Road, Dover
- Route 343 (south intersection), Dover

- Wassaic Metro-North Train Station, Amenia
- CR 58 (Coleman Station Road), North East
- CR 5 (Smithfield Road), North East

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: These intersections were initially identified by the CPTF and/or the public as having a perceived accident problem.

Reason for Elimination: Upon review of the list of intersections that have safety issues, the CPTF eliminated these intersections from further consideration due to greater concern for safety issues at other locations.

MANAGEMENT TOOLS

9. Establish a Transportation Development District (TDD) and assess impact fees.

Location: Route 22 within the Harlem Valley

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives:

The TDD is a special assessment district that provides taxing authority to raise funds for transportation improvements. Impact fees are a method to transfer the capital cost of an improvement to property owners or developers. Fees can be in the form of an exaction (one-time only), sponsorship of a transportation program, or improvements to facilities directly affected by the development.³ TDDs have been used

³ New York State Department of Transportation. *Public-Private Financing of Road Improvements Handbook*.

elsewhere in New York to fund major transportation projects, to raise the local share for improvements to a state highway, or to implement mitigation required for new development. Special assessment districts must be individually approved by the New York State legislature. This tool is very forward-thinking and encourages communities to plan for growth rather than reacting to uncontrolled growth. “Impact fees must be structured so that growth is controlled but not prohibited. The fee rates must be reasonable in such a way that they cannot be challenged as taking property without due process.”⁴ An example of a model impact fee bylaw is available from the Cape Cod Commission’s Model Bylaws and Regulations Project (<http://www.vsa.cape.com/~cccom/bylaws/impactfee.html>).

Reason for Elimination: Requires State legislation for implementation and may have an impact on the development potential.

10. Institute a process to require developer-paid professional services, including planning, engineering, legal, and clerical costs.

Locations:

- Pawling
- Dover
- Amenia
- North East

⁴ Ibid.

- Village of Millerton

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: In connection with an application to the Planning or Zoning Board, the applicant would be required to deposit funds in an escrow account to cover the cost of professional review services. This removes the cost of review from the general community and ensures that appropriate technical experts assist the community in the review process. An example of this requirement is provided in the Village of Pawling Zoning Code §98-54 Fees.

Reason for Elimination: Received inadequate support.

11. Develop a process for regional impact assessment.

Location: Route 22 within the Harlem Valley

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Certain development projects, due to their size, location, or character, affect more than one community.

Reason for Elimination: The Harlem Valley Partnership currently fulfills this role.

12. Performance evaluation.

Locations:

- Pawling
- Village of Pawling
- Dover
- Amenia
- North East

- Village of Millerton

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: The Village of Pawling Zoning Code §98-20 Performance Standards includes a section to “regulate and control the generation and flow of vehicular traffic so as to prevent hazardous conditions, traffic congestion and excessive noise in the streets.” These performance standards, although an excellent first step, are vague and open to multiple interpretations. It would be more appropriate to specifically identify an acceptable Level of Service and require developer mitigation whenever a development causes an intersection approach to drop below that standard or adds 10 percent additional traffic to an approach already below the standard.

Reason for Elimination: Not as high a priority as other tools.

ACCESS MANAGEMENT

13. Landscape commercial space.

Location: Harlem Valley

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives:

Landscaping in and around commercial developments provides a visual buffer from roadside development, helping to maintain the rural character of the area. “Municipalities should require landscaping performance bonds of developers to ensure that site plan specifications are adhered to and to ensure replacement should plants fail to survive.”⁵

⁵ Roadscape Guidelines, Dutchess Roadside Council

Reason for Elimination: Most of the municipalities require some form of landscaping through zoning and/or site plan review.

14. Provide climbing lanes.

Locations:

- Route 22 between Dover High School and East Duncan Hill Road
- Route 22 near crossing of the Swamp River

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project

Objectives: Route 22 is part of the Primary Highway System, designated by the federal government, and as



such serves an important function of providing through-travel and access for tractor-trailers and other heavy vehicles like gravel trucks. Heavy vehicles can contribute to congestion and driver frustration particularly when they are unable to maintain speeds on steep grades. These issues are exacerbated on rural roads, like Route 22, which has narrow lanes and limited shoulder availability.

Reason for Elimination: Widening the road to accommodate a full climbing lane is counterintuitive to the desired goal of maintaining rural character. Accommodation of heavy vehicles, through a provision of adequate shoulders, is included in the cross-sections proposed in the Harlem Valley Transportation Plan.

15. Establish a Local Access Permit Program that enforces more stringent access standards than NYSDOT.

Locations:

- Pawling
- Dover
- Amenia
- North East

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: The local access permit process should address all access management issues including driveway spacing and dimensions, number of driveways, shared/ joint driveways, approach grades, turning radius, surfacing materials, drainage requirements, sight distance, and pedestrian/bicycle access. The process would be in addition to the State process, not in lieu of it. Existing non-conforming uses will be reevaluated when a permit is requested for a new driveway or a change in use or intensity is proposed. Local access management would apply to all roads within the community.

Reason for Elimination: Due to staff and budget constraints at the municipal level that it is better to address driveway spacing and access management through a Limited Access Overlay District and incorporating Access Management strategies into the site plan review and subdivision regulations.

SIGNAGE GUIDELINES/WAYFINDING

All strategies in this category were progressed to the second stage of evaluation.

PEDESTRIAN/BICYCLE SAFETY/MOBILITY

All strategies in this category were progressed to the second stage of evaluation.

SAFETY

16. Education Programs.

Location:

- Route 22 Corridor

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project

Objectives: Education programs are implemented to:

- Remind community of traffic laws,
- Make driver's aware of pedestrian safety issues,
- Make drivers aware of speeding violations, and
- Educate drivers on traffic calming devices and identify proposed locations within villages and hamlets.



Education/safety campaigns can be instituted through flyers, newsletters, newspaper articles, and exhibits in public spaces such as Town Hall, libraries and local fairs.

Reason for Elimination: Education programs are labor intensive, which would place a strain on the communities within the study area. In

addition, these programs are not self-enforcing and there is limited documentation of their effectiveness.

17. Signs: events/safety.

Location:

- Varies as needed along the Route 22 Corridor

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Use of variable message signs to inform motorists of special events, alternative routes, safety precautions such as icy roadway conditions, construction activity and recent accidents that may cause congestion.

Reason for Elimination: Permanent variable message signs would impact the rural character of the area. Mobile variable message signs could be used as needed but the NYSDOT has a limited number for use on all its routes.

18. School Safety Program.

Locations: Elementary and secondary schools throughout the corridor.

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Introduce pedestrian and vehicular safety programs within school curriculum. These programs are reminders to young students on the importance of following the rules of the road as both pedestrians and bicyclists and providing safety tips. Examples of program items include how a walk signal works and why they should be used when available and how bicycles and vehicles can share the road. Safety programs for young drivers can also be introduced.



Reason for Elimination: This was not as high a priority as other strategies.

AESTHETICS

19. Establish an Adopt-A-Highway maintenance program, sponsored by the county.

Location:

- Dutchess County

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: The program would rely on companies, clubs, and organizations to show their commitment to the region by “adopting” a stretch of Route 22. The intent of this tool is to promote interest in and support for maintaining a pleasant driving environment on Route 22 and therefore promoting additional investment and tourism. This program would be modeled after the existing Adopt-A-Highway and Monroe County in Bloom programs in Monroe County, New York. A volunteer group would commit to maintaining a segment of highway for a two-year period. Work would include raking and picking up trash. The work would also include seasonal planting of flowers, weeding, and watering. The County would provide the garbage bags, safety vests, “Work Zone” signs, and roadside trash pick-up service. The County would also provide seasonal flowers and landscape design. An Adopt-A-Highway program coordinator would visit the volunteer group to provide training in maintenance and highway safety.

Reason for Elimination: This was not as high a priority as other strategies. The NYSDOT currently operates an Adopt-a-Highway

Program, which provides for trash pick-up but does not provide seasonal flowers or landscape design.

20. Scenic byways/roads program.

Locations:

- Selected sections of Route 22

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives:

Scenic roads or byways are a designation that helps to preserve and protect the scenic beauty and character of a rural roadway. “State Scenic Byways are transportation corridors that are of particular statewide interest. They are representative of a region's scenic, recreational, cultural, natural, historic or archaeological significance. A byway is organized around at least one theme. A theme is based on related resources that are located along the byway corridor. These resources can be things like landmarks, buildings, mountains, vistas, businesses, parks, historical sites. . . nearly anything of interest or value than is visible from, adjacent to, accessed by or associated with the road. Attracting tourism is often one of the reasons that byway designations are sought. Some planning is necessary to make sure that the byway benefits both the community and its visitors.”⁶ Existing Scenic Roads in Dutchess County include:

- County Route 103 (13.2 miles),
- Kingston-Rhinecliff Bridge (1.4 miles),
- Mid-Hudson Bridge (0.6 miles),
- State Route 9 (2.3 miles),

⁶ <http://www.dot.state.ny.us/scenic/descript.html>

- Norrie State Park Roads (1.6 miles),
- Old Post Road/Golf Course Road (2.6 miles),
- Santage Road (0.6 miles), and
- Stony Brook Street (0.7 miles)

Reason for Elimination: Not as high a priority as other tools. Many of the techniques that would be used by local communities to implement the program, such as access management, streetscape improvements and signage regulations are being recommended for implementation through the Route 22 Corridor Study.

21. Scenic overlooks.

Locations:

- Selected scenic vistas on Route 22

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Scenic overlooks provide an opportunity to allow drivers to stop, explore and enjoy the natural beauty of the surrounding landscape. Properly designed pull-offs provide for safe egress from the highway and maintain through traffic flow.

Reason for Elimination: Did not receive significant support in the public arena. Specific locations, on Route 22, were not identified through public and advisory committee meetings. There would also be long-term maintenance costs associated with upkeep of the pull-off area.

PUBLIC TRANSPORTATION

22. North-south LOOP service.

Locations:

- Route 22 Corridor

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: The current LOOP bus schedules serving the area are primarily east-west routes, with service to and from Poughkeepsie. Service along Route 22 is provided by LOOP Routes 8, 9, and 10—although it is limited and does not extend south of Pawling.

Reason for Elimination: Dutchess County is examining the possibility of Route 22 bus service between Wingdale/Pawling and Brewster (Putnam County). The service would connect with Metro-North at Brewster, PART (Putnam Transit and HART (Housatonic Area Transit). The service would accommodate peak hour commuting activity to serve businesses along the Route 22 corridor.

23. Subsidized shared ride taxi shuttle service.

Locations:

- Metro-North Railroad Stations
- Pawling Station
- Harlem Valley-Wingdale Station
- Dover Plains Station
- Tenmile River Station
- Wassaic Station

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: The intent of this strategy is to use taxi shuttles with subsidized fares to complement existing transit service. Taxi shuttles increase choices, efficiency and public value for public transportation by providing a more extensive fixed route system using smaller vehicles. The service provides a connection between fixed route transit operations and remote residential areas. Riders are attracted by curbside level of service while improving fixed route accessibility for seniors and disabled. This program could be implemented through a partnership between Metro-North and a local taxi service or a partnership with the County and a local taxi service. Initial program development could be limited to one vehicle per station for 8-10 hours of peak service.⁷

Reason for Elimination: This was not as high a priority as other strategies.

24. Dial-a-ride bus service.

Locations:

- Route 22 Corridor

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Transit demand in rural areas is often too small or too dispersed to justify fixed route service. An alternative strategy is to provide a demand-responsive system, minimizing vehicles miles and vehicle hours of service. Dial-a-ride uses vans to offer door-to-door service based on a 4-hour advance schedule by telephone. Unlike the shared taxi service this would be

⁷ Wambalaba, Francis W., *Private/Public Shuttle Service Opportunities: A System's Approach*, Transportation Research Board 2002 Annual Meeting – Paper Submittal.

operated through the local transit service provider. This service is attractive to the elderly and handicapped that has trouble accessing fixed route service.

Reason for Elimination: This was not as high a priority as other strategies.

25. Convenience/tourist retail.

Locations:

- Adjacent to Metro-North Railroad Stations.
- Tenmile River Station
- Wassaic Station

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: The intent of this strategy is to provide transit-oriented development adjacent to railroad stations to provide convenience services for riders and reduce vehicle trips in the corridor. Retail services would potentially include dry cleaners, bank services, coffee shops, and bike rental facilities.

Reason for Elimination: There is a concern that this type of development would compete with existing and future retail activity in the designated growth areas.

TRAVEL DEMAND MANAGEMENT

As development in the Harlem Valley grows, increasing demands will be placed on the roadway system. A growing awareness of environmental impacts, the expense of roadway construction, and community opposition to intrusions on their quality of life and the rural character of the area, have made it increasingly clear that traffic congestion can no longer be abated by building one's way out. Alternative strategies include Travel Demand Management (TDM) measures that reduce dependency on the automobile by encouraging travelers to use alternatives to driving alone, especially during peak time periods. The following TDM measures encourage the use of public transportation, ridesharing, bicycling, and walking.

26. Park-&-ride lots.

Locations: Select locations along Route 22 by taking advantage of partnerships with private businesses that have underutilized parking facilities.

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives: Park-&-Ride lots provide an opportunity for residents, especially in rural, dispersed communities, to have a convenient and central location to meet and complete the remainder of their commuting trip by carpooling. This reduces the volume of traffic and associated congestion on Route 22.

Reason for Elimination: This was not as high a priority as other strategies and there was concern that the corridor lacked adequate demand to make the approach successful.

27. Carpool matches.

Locations: Local businesses along the Route 22 Corridor.

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives:

Communities would encourage new and existing businesses to help employees find potential matches for carpooling. This can be accomplished by providing employees with a list of co-workers who live within a short distance of their home. It is then left to the employees to establish a carpool arrangement. Additional carpool incentives by the employer, such as priority parking spaces, will further support this strategy.

Reason for Elimination: This was not as high a priority as other strategies and there was concern that the corridor lacked adequate demand to make the approach successful.

28. Commuter shuttles.

Locations: Local businesses along the Route 22 Corridor.

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives:

Communities would encourage new and existing businesses to provide employees with a shuttle service between the place of business and fixed transit routes.

Reason for Elimination: This can be a costly service unless demand is very high or several businesses share the cost. At this time there is insufficient density along the corridor and inadequate transit demand for this service.

29. Flexible hours.

Locations: Local businesses along the Route 22 Corridor.

Existing Characteristics of Concern and/or Project Objectives:

Communities would encourage new and existing businesses to allow their employees to work flexible hours, reducing the number of employees arriving or departing during peak commuter periods. This strategy reduces peak hour traffic volumes and associated congestion.

Reason for Elimination: This was not as high a priority as other strategies.

THIS PAGE INTENTIONALLY LEFT BLANK.